



Appendix I
MCA Table
Section 3.2D

Crinken Lane to St.
Anne's Roundabout
Options

MCA Section 3.2D - Crinken Lane to St. Anne's Roundabout					
Assessment Criteria	Assessment Sub-Criteria	Previous MCA EPR Option 2.2D from previous assessment	New Option Scheme Option 3.2D4 (double cycle lanes through village, revised Quinn's Road to Crinken Lane link)	New Option Scheme Option 3.2D5 (northbound bus lane through village, revised Quinn's Road to Crinken Lane link)	New Option Scheme Option 3.2D6 (maintain current public realm through village, revised Quinn's Road to Crinken Lane link)
Economy	1.a. Capital Cost	Road widening to provide bus lanes on both sides of the road through Shankill Village, and more land take to south of village	Minimal cost intervention to provide cycle paths. Same lesser land take costs as options 5 & 6 south of village	Additional kerbing and drainage works, alongside specific bus provision for third lane. Same lesser land take costs as options 4 & 6 south of village	Minor cost intervention compared to other options. Same lesser land take costs as options 4 & 5 south of village
	Rank				
	1.b. Transport Reliability and Quality	Bus lanes are provided for southbound buses through Shankill Village, the northbound bus lane stretches from the Stonebridge Close junction to the Lower Road junction, and from Quinn's Rd junction to Crinken Lane. Two queue relocation systems will be used at Quinn's Road and Lower Road junctions to provide priority for northbound buses. These bus priority measures will reduce delays when the village is congested and will lead to faster and more reliable journey times. Separate bus lanes provided back as far as Crinken Lane.	Two combined traffic lanes are maintained through Shankill village with northbound bus signal priority systems in place at St Anne's church junction and at Quinn's Rd roundabout to serve the village. A Northbound bus lane is in place from Crinken Lane to Quinn's Rd, while additional queue relocation measures may be provided Southbound as the traffic modelling dictates. Bus stops will artificially hold traffic back from passing buses, reinforcing bus priority. Cycle lanes through Shankill village will ensure buses not held up by slower cycles.	Two general lanes are maintained through Shankill village with a northbound bus lane from Stonebridge Close to Lower Rd junction, and a bus signal priority systems in place at St Anne's church junction and at Quinn's Rd roundabout to serve the village. Only two combined lanes provided between Quinn's Rd and Stonebridge Close. A northbound bus lane is in place from Crinken Lane to Quinn's Rd, while additional queue relocation measures may be provided southbound as the traffic modelling dictates. Bus stops will artificially hold traffic back from passing buses, reinforcing bus priority.	Two combined traffic lanes are maintained through Shankill village with bus signal priority systems in place. For northbound buses signal controlled priority is proposed from the new junction at Olcovar through to the Dublin Road north of Stonebridge Road junction, with junctions in between detecting and prioritising approaching buses. For southbound buses, signal controlled priority is proposed from St. Anne's Church junction to just south of Crinken Lane, with junctions in between detecting and prioritising approaching buses. In-line bus stops will artificially hold traffic back from passing buses, reinforcing bus priority on stretches without bus lanes. A northbound bus lane is in place from Crinken Lane as far as the Olcovar entrance. Speed restrictions will be in place from the Olcovar junction to Stonebridge Road. Although shared lanes through Shankill village will mean buses may be held behind cyclists, a 30kph speed restriction is proposed for village section to improve cyclist safety and enhance village feel, which will reduce the impact of bus delay compared to other options (as buses would also expect to travel more slowly through the village compared to these options).
	Rank				
Integration	2.a. Land Use Integration	DLRCoCo Development Plan "To protect, provide for and/or improve mixed-use neighbourhood centre facilities" in Shankill Village, and "To protect and/or improve residential amenity" south of village. No difference between options.	DLRCoCo Development Plan "To protect, provide for and/or improve mixed-use neighbourhood centre facilities" in Shankill Village, and "To protect and/or improve residential amenity" south of village. No difference between options.	DLRCoCo Development Plan "To protect, provide for and/or improve mixed-use neighbourhood centre facilities" in Shankill Village, and "To protect and/or improve residential amenity" south of village. No difference between options.	DLRCoCo Development Plan "To protect, provide for and/or improve mixed-use neighbourhood centre facilities" in Shankill Village, and "To protect and/or improve residential amenity" south of village. No difference between options.
	Rank				
	2.b. Residential Population and Employment Catchments	Options considered equal under this criteria	Options considered equal under this criteria	Options considered equal under this criteria	Options considered equal under this criteria
	Rank				
	2.c. Transport Network Integration	Options considered equal under this criteria	Options considered equal under this criteria	Options considered equal under this criteria	Options considered equal under this criteria
	Rank				
2.d. Cycle Network Integration	Ties in with broader cycle route provision either side of village, but indirect diversion route provided through Shankill	Ties in with broader cycle route provision, and provides direct segregated path through village	Ties in with broader cycle route provision, but no specific cycle lanes provided	Ties in with broader cycle route provision, but no specific cycle lanes provided. Slower speeds should be more inviting for cyclists	
Rank					
2.e. Traffic Network Integration	Bus priority signals will prioritise buses ahead of general traffic, but private traffic has dedicated lanes along route in both directions apart from Stonebridge Close to Quinn's Rd northbound.	Bus priority signals will prioritise buses ahead of general traffic, and general traffic will be unable to pass buses at bus stops. Northbound bus lane south of village will provide separate traffic lane for private vehicles.	Bus priority signals will prioritise buses ahead of general traffic, and general traffic will be unable to pass buses at southbound bus stop, but northbound private cars will have separate lane from buses through village. Northbound bus lane south of village will provide separate traffic lane for private vehicles.	Bus priority signals will prioritise buses ahead of general traffic, and general traffic will be unable to pass buses at bus stops. Speed restrictions will be in place to slow traffic through village.	
Rank					
Accessibility & Social Inclusion	3.a. Key Trip Attractors (Education/Health/Commercial/Employment)	Options considered equal under this criteria	Options considered equal under this criteria	Options considered equal under this criteria	Options considered equal under this criteria
	Rank				
	3.b. Deprived Geographic Areas	Options considered equal under this criteria	Options considered equal under this criteria	Options considered equal under this criteria	Options considered equal under this criteria
Rank					
Safety	4.a. Road Safety	4 traffic lanes provided along most of route including through village, and off-route diverted cycle path also provided	2 lanes of traffic provided through village, and three south of village. Segregated cycle lanes provided over a section.	3 lanes of traffic through village, and south of village. Cycles share traffic lanes	Two lanes of traffic provided through village, with three lanes south of the new Olcovar junction. Cycles share traffic/bus lanes. Reduced speeds implemented through village.
	Rank				
Environment	5.a. Archaeology and Cultural Heritage	Largest impact on cultural heritage (property boundaries) due to 4 lane provision through and beyond village	Reduced impact on cultural heritage of property boundaries due to reduced lane provision in Shankill village and beyond compared to previous assessment	Reduced impact on cultural heritage of property boundaries due to reduced lane provision in Shankill village and beyond compared to previous assessment	Reduced impact on cultural heritage of property boundaries due to reduced lane provision in Shankill village and beyond compared to previous assessment
	Rank				
	5.b. Architectural Heritage	Largest impact on architectural heritage due to 4 lane provision beyond village	Reduced impact on architectural heritage due to 3 lane provision beyond village	Reduced impact on architectural heritage due to 3 lane provision beyond village	Reduced impact on architectural heritage due to 2/3 lane provision beyond village
	Rank				
	5.c. Flora & Fauna	4 lane provision between Crinken Lane and Quinn's Rd roundabout will have largest impact of all options on trees adjacent to road and through village	Cycle paths will work with trees in village, and reduced lane provision outside of village will reduce impact on adjacent trees (though not fully remove)	No change in village, and reduced lane provision outside of village will reduce impact on adjacent trees (though not fully remove)	No change in village, and reduced lane provision outside of village will reduce impact on adjacent trees (though not fully remove)
	Rank				
	5.d. Soils and Geology	Options considered equal under this criteria	Options considered equal under this criteria	Options considered equal under this criteria	Options considered equal under this criteria
	Rank				
	5.e. Hydrology	Options considered equal under this criteria	Options considered equal under this criteria	Options considered equal under this criteria	Options considered equal under this criteria
	Rank				
	5.f. Landscape and Visual	This option requires reallocation of road reserve from two lanes with parking both sides, to a three-lane carriageway with parking on one side only and removal of street trees and reduction in footpath widths through the village. This Option has the most severe visual impact on the streetscape of Shankill Village. 4 lane provision will have greatest impact on landscape along this section beyond the village	2 lane provision through village with cycle paths will improve visual character compared to most other routes	3 lane provision through village and beyond will have slight negative effect compared to Sub Options 3.2D4 & 3.2D6, but less of an impact compared to Sub Option 3	Enhanced public realm provision and no additional lanes through village will provide greatest positive impact for visual feel of these route options
Rank					

5.g. Air Quality	Additional traffic lanes may cause associated air quality impacts	Bus priority signals and in line bus stops will cause standing traffic with associated air quality impacts	Bus priority signals and in line bus stops will cause standing traffic with associated air quality impacts	Bus priority signals and in line bus stops will cause standing traffic with associated air quality impacts
Rank				
5.h. Noise and Vibration	General and bus traffic will be brought closer to properties through village so option considered worse than others.	General and bus traffic will be brought no closer to properties through village so option considered better than others.	General and bus traffic will be brought closer to properties through village so option considered worse than others.	General and bus traffic will be brought no closer to properties through village so option considered better than others.
Rank				
5.i Land Use Character	Change to feel of village setting, and greater impact south of village	Change to feel of village setting, and greater impact south of village	Change to feel of village setting, and greater impact south of village	Minimal impact to village setting and reduced impact of adjacent lands by retaining roadside footpath south of Quinn's Rd. Will encourage slower movement by all modes which will enhance the 'place' nature of the village rather than the 'movement' function of the corridor of other options which will detract from the land use character
Rank				